

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

ANWAR ALKHATIB,
Plaintiff,

-against-

Case No. 13-CV-2337 (ARR) (SMG)

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH
Defendants.

SHAHADAT TUHIN
Plaintiff,

-against-

Case No. 13-CV-5643 (ARR) (SMG)

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH
Defendants.

SIMON GABRYS,
Plaintiff,

-against-

Case No. 13-CV-7290 (ARR) (SMG)

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH
Defendants.

BORIS FREIRE, et al,
Plaintiffs,

-against-

Case No. 13-CV-7291 (ARR) (SMG)

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH
Defendants.

ZHENG HUI DONG,
Plaintiff,

-against-

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH

Defendants.

Case No. 14-CV-2980 (ARR) (SMG)

NASRIN CHOWDHURY,
Plaintiff,

-against-

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH

Defendants,

Case No. 14-CV-2981 (ARR) (SMG)

TAREQUE AHMED
Plaintiff,

-against-

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH

Defendants.

Case No. 15-CV-0284 (ARR) (SMG)

YSABEL BANON,
Plaintiff,

-against-

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH

Defendants.

Case No. 15-CV-4691 (ARR) (SMG)

CHEA SUNG PARK,

Plaintiff,

-against-

Case No. 15-CV-5374 (ARR) (SMG)

NEW YORK MOTOR GROUP LLC,
PLANET MOTOR CARS, INC.,
MAMDOH ELTOUBY, AND
NADA SMITH

Defendants.

**DECLARATION IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION IN LIMINE FOR
SPOILIATION SANCTIONS**

Ariana Eva Lindermayer, an attorney duly licensed to practice law in the State of New York,
does hereby declare pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746 that the following facts are truthful:

1. I am a senior staff attorney at MFY Legal Services Inc., counsel for Plaintiff Shahadat Tuhin in one of the above-referenced actions, and, as such, am familiar with the facts and documents relevant to this dispute.
2. I make this Declaration in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion in Limine for Spoliation Sanctions.
3. Specifically, I submit this Declaration to place before the Court true and correct copies of the following exhibits referenced in the Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law:
 - a. Exhibit A: Transcript of Deposition of Nada Smith, taken February 26, 2015
 - b. Exhibit B: Transcript of Deposition of Ysabel Banon, taken August 5, 2016
 - c. Exhibit C: Transcript of Deposition of Mamdoh Eltouby, taken April 27 and 28, 2015
 - d. Exhibit D: Letter from Ariana Lindermayer to New York Motor Group, dated September 12, 2013

- e. Exhibit E: Letter from Ariana Lindermayer to Mamdoh Eltouby, dated September 24, 2013
 - f. Exhibit F: District Attorney Queens County, Press Release, March 24, 2014
 - g. Exhibit G: Transcript of Deposition of Shahadat Tuhin, taken October 27, 2014 and November 3, 2014
 - h. Exhibit H: Transcript of Deposition of Julio Estrada, taken March 30, 2015
 - i. Exhibit I: Emails from Ahmad Keshavarz to Lloyd Weinstein, dated December 3, 2013 and December 9, 2013
 - j. Exhibit J: Email from Lloyd Weinstein to Ariana Lindermayer, dated March 13, 2014
 - k. Exhibit K: Plaintiffs' Omnibus Request for Production of Documents, dated July 3, 2014
 - l. Exhibit L: NYMG's Response to Plaintiffs' Omnibus Request for Production of Documents, dated February 15, 2015
 - m. Exhibit M: Emails from Ariana Lindermayer to Richard Simon, dated April 7, 2015 and April 16, 2015
 - n. Exhibit N: Third Party Subpoena to Auto Solution
 - o. Exhibit O: Transcript of Deposition of Boris Freire, taken January 21, 2015
- 4. Plaintiffs received no response to the requests in Exhibit M.
 - 5. Plaintiffs received no response to the requests in Exhibit N.
 - 6. The legal arguments relevant to this motion, setting forth the reasons that Plaintiffs' motion should be granted, have been set out in Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law.
 - 7. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: New York, NY
February 27, 2017

/s/ Ariana Lindermayer

Ariana Lindermayer
MFY LEGAL SERVICES, INC.
299 Broadway, 4th Floor
New York, NY 10007
Tel: 212-417-3742
Fax: 212-417-3890
Email: alindermayer@mfy.org
Attorney for Plaintiff Tuhin